Short communication: Survival of *Vaccinia virus* in inoculated cheeses during 60-day ripening

Izabelle S. Rehfeld,* Ana Luiza S. Fraiha,* Ana Carolina D. Matos,* Maria Isabel M. C. Guedes,* Erica A. Costa,* Marcelo R. de Souza,† Luigi F. L. Cavalcante,‡ and Zélia I. P. Lobato*¹

*Departamento de Medicina Veterinária Preventiva, Laboratório de Pesquisa em Virologia Animal

†Departamento de Tecnologia e Inspeção de Produtos de Origem Animal, Laboratório de Microbiologia de Alimentos, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Avenida Antônio Carlos, 6627, CEP: 31270-901, Belo Horizonte, MG, Brazil

‡Intergado—Rio Paranaguá, Jardim Riacho, 1463, CEP: 32280-300, Contagem, MG, Brazil

ABSTRACT

Bovine vaccinia is a neglected zoonosis caused by *Vaccinia virus* (VACV) and has a major economic and public health effect in Brazil. Previous studies showed infectious VACV particles in milk from either experimentally or naturally infected cows and in fresh cheeses prepared with experimentally contaminated milk. Ripening is a process that leads to major changes in the physical and chemical characteristics of cheese, reducing contamination by spoilage, pathogenic microorganisms, or both. However, it is not known if VACV infectious particles persist after the ripening process. To investigate this issue, viral infectivity at different ripening times was studied in cheeses manufactured with milk experimentally contaminated with VACV strain Guarani P2 (GP2). Cheeses were analyzed at 1, 7, 14, 21, 45, and 60 d of ripening at 25°C. Viral DNA was quantified by real-time PCR, and VACV isolation and titration were performed in Vero cells. The whole experiment was repeated 4 times. Analysis of the mean viral DNA quantification and infectivity indicated a reduction of approximately 2 logs along the ripening process; however, infectious viral particles (1.7×10^2 pfu/mL) could still be recovered at d 60 of ripening. These findings indicate that the ripening process reduces VACV infectivity, but it was not able to inactivate completely the viral particles after 60 d.

Key words: cheese ripening, raw milk inoculated, *Vaccinia virus*, viral infectivity

Short Communication

Bovine vaccinia (BV) is a neglected zoonotic disease caused by *Vaccinia virus* (VACV), *Orthopoxvirus*

(OPXV) genus. Bovine vaccinia is an important disease in Brazil, due mainly to its implications in public health and economic losses in the dairy chain (Lobato et al., 2005). *Vaccinia virus* infectious viral particles were detected in raw milk from naturally and experimentally infected cows (Abrahão et al., 2009; de Oliveira et al., 2015) and in fresh cheeses produced with experimentally contaminated raw milk (de Oliveira et al., 2010). The production of artisanal cheeses with raw milk is a traditional activity in Brazil and artisanal cheese is a very important product for the local economy. However, the use of raw milk poses a potential risk because it may be contaminated by infectious agents (Machado et al., 2004). These previous data are alarming because they suggest the possibility that contaminated milk and artisanal cheeses may be a source of VACV transmission to humans by handling or consuming these products. Therefore, the aim of this study was to produce cheese with experimentally VACV-inoculated raw milk and analyzed the viral infectivity during the 60-d ripening process.

Twenty-four liters of raw milk was used for cheese production. Twelve liters was inoculated for a final concentration of 10^5 pfu of VACV per milliliter (de Oliveira et al., 2010). The other 12 L of raw milk was used to produce the noncontaminated control cheeses. Each cheese was manufactured using 2 L of raw milk with the addition of 2% commercial natural yogurt from Nestlé (Ibica, Minas Gerais State, Brazil) as a source for fermenting microorganisms. Additionally, for enzymatic coagulation, 0.08% (vol/vol) of commercial liquid rennet HA-LA (Chr. Hansen SA, São Paulo, Brazil) was added. The cheeses, weighing on average 250 g, were removed from the molds after 24 h, and they were stored in a biochemical oxygen demand incubator at 25°C for up to 60 d. The cheeses were produced in a laboratory scale, in a way similar to the process of Minas cheese manufacturing. They were ripened for 60 d due to the requirement of the Brazilian legislation that establishes a minimum of 60 d of ripening for cheeses made of

Received January 5, 2017.

Accepted May 29, 2017.

¹Corresponding author: ziplobato@gmail.com

raw milk. The ripening temperature was 25°C to mimic the conditions in which artisanal cheeses are ripened. Six contaminated and 6 noncontaminated cheeses were produced. One cheese was randomly selected at 1, 7, 14, 21, 45, and 60 d of ripening. Additionally, during the cheese production process, contaminated and noncontaminated milk, whey, and curd samples were collected. To improve the repeatability of the viral infectivity in ripened cheese at different ripening times, the experiment was repeated 4 times, totaling 4 cheeses per ripening time. Noncontaminated and contaminated cheeses were collected randomly at each established ripening time (1, 7, 14, 21, 45, and 60 d of ripening). The samples were macerated, diluted 1:10 in PBS, and centrifuged. The supernatant fluids were collected and stored at −80°C until being submitted for real-time PCR (de Oliveira et al., 2015) and viral titration in Vero (*Cercopithecus aethiops*, ATCC: CCL-81) cells (de Oliveira et al., 2010). The effect of ripening times on the viral titration and DNA quantification was tested by a simple or quadratic linear regression model using orthogonal polynomials.

Cheese samples from the d 1 to 60 of ripening were infective when inoculated in Vero cell monolayers. Milk, curd, and whey, products from the cheese manufacturing process, were also infective ($P \leq 0.05$; Table 1). The DNA quantification during all the ripening period did not show a significant difference ($P > 0.05$). However, a decreasing tendency in viral DNA during cheese ripening was verified (Table 2).

This work showed that VACV remains viable in the cheese for at least 60 d of ripening at 25°C. Moreover, the real-time PCR technique showed a decrease in viral DNA, maybe due to degradation/denaturation, during the ripening process. Viral DNA to degradation/denaturation could have been caused by proteolytic enzymes produced during the cheese ripening process. Two factors may explain this viral vulnerability to degradation/denaturation during ripening. The first factor may be related to the presence of many intracellular mature virion particles in the inoculum. These viral particles have an outer lipoprotein membrane (Moss, 2013), which may have been denatured by lipolysis and proteolysis processes that occur during ripening. The second factor may be that VACV was not associated with milk cells as it was inoculated directly in milk, contributing to the viral particle degradation during ripening. The association of VACV with milk somatic cells of experimentally infected dairy cows was suggested by de Oliveira et al. (2015). The VACV associated with cells could be protected in contaminated commercial artisanal cheeses and could remain viable in cheeses for a longer time, increasing the risk of viral transmission after consumption of these products.

Table 1. Mean value of *Vaccinia virus* (VACV) strain Guarani P2 (GP2) titer (pfu/mL or pfu/g) in experimentally contaminated milk, whey, curd, and cheese samples, ripened for 60 d at 25°C

Item	Ripening time ¹								P-value ²			
	Milk	Whey	Curd	C1	C7	C14	C21	C45	C60	Days	L	Q
Mean value of VACV-GP2 titer (pfu/mL or pfu/g)	1.0 × 10 ⁵	2.2 × 10 ³	8.7 × 10 ⁴	1.6 × 10 ⁴ (±0.076)	1.8 × 10 ³ (±0.037)	2.9 × 10 ³ (±0.044)	9.3 × 10 ² (±0.37)	2.3 × 10 ² (±0.112)	1.7 × 10 ² (±0.076)	<0.0001	<0.0001	0.103

¹C1, C7, C14, C21, C45, and C60 represent cheese samples analyzed during ripening up to 60 d at 25°C. Intervals represent SEM for each day of ripening.

²L = linear effect; Q = quadratic effect.

Table 2. Mean value of DNA *Vaccinia virus* (VACV) strain Guarani P2 (GP2) quantifications (GU/g) in cheeses produced with experimentally contaminated raw milk, ripened for 60 d at 25°C

Item	Ripening time ¹						P-value ²	
	C1	C7	C14	C21	C45	C60	Days	Q
Mean value of DNA VACV-GP2 quantification (genomic units/g)	4,022.73 (±152.87)	2,955.08 (±1,225.41)	2,504.24 (±72.81)	2,428.84 (±661.76)	2,241.72 (±88.95)	1,418.55 (±734.81)	0.6614	0.548

¹C1, C7, C14, C21, C45, and C60 represent cheese samples analyzed during ripening up to 60 d at 25°C. Intervals represent SEM for each day of ripening.

²L = linear effect; Q = quadratic effect.

As the Minas artisanal cheese ripening occurs, the moisture content and the water activity of the cheeses decreases (Castro et al., 2016). However, those conditions did not alter the viability of the VACV in the produced cheeses. The VACV infectious particles were detected in whey samples. A previous study showed the infectivity of VACV in whey and curd of fresh cheeses manufactured in laboratory scale with contaminated milk (de Oliveira et al., 2010). During artisanal cheese manufacturing in Brazilian dairy farms, the whey is used as a lactic acid bacterial culture, which is obtained from the whey drained from the cheeses manufactured on the previous day. In the dairy product industry, fermented milk beverages are produced from the mixture of milk and whey and are intended mainly for consumption by children. Thus, if this whey is contaminated with VACV, it may be a potential source of viral transmission as well.

Despite reports of humans with lesions in the mouth and oral mucosa associated with consumption of raw milk contaminated with *Buffalopox virus*, a VACV variant that occurs in India (Gurav et al., 2011), this has not yet been reported in Brazil. However, neutralizing anti-OPXV antibodies were detected in humans, including children, living in an endemic area for bovine vaccinia in Brazil, who had never contacted sick cattle and had not been vaccinated against smallpox. One hypothesis for their seropositivity to anti-OPXV antibodies was raw milk and artisanal cheese consumption and participation in cheese production, which would have been exposure/risk factors (Costa et al., 2016). A recent study from our group demonstrated, in a murine model, subclinical VACV infection by oral ingestion of contaminated milk (Rehfeld et al., 2015). The VACV is shed in milk from infected cows even after complete healing of the lesions (de Oliveira et al., 2015), which could contribute to the use of this milk for consumption or for cheese manufacturing, increasing the risk of infection through ingestion.

This work suggests that cheeses contaminated with VACV can be a source of viral transmission during handling and consumption of the product, even when subjected to a ripening process of 60 d at 25°C. Moreover, whey contaminated with VACV could also represent a potential risk for public health because it may be a source of viral transmission in the artisanal cheeses and other dairy products.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This study was supported by Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq, Brazil), Coordenação de Aperfeiçoamento de Pessoal de Nível Superior (CAPES, Brazil), and Fundação de Am-

paro à Pesquisa de Minas Gerais (FAPEMIG, Minas Gerais State, Brazil). We are also grateful to Grazielle Cossenzo Fiorentino Galinari (Departamento de Medicina Veterinária Preventiva, Escola de Veterinária, UFMG) and Maura Regina Almeida (Departamento de Tecnologia e Inspeção de Produtos de Origem Animal, Escola de Veterinária, UFMG) for their excellent technical support. ZIPL received a fellowship from CNPq.

REFERENCES

- Abrahão, J. S., T. M. L. Oliveira, R. K. Campos, M. C. Madureira, E. G. Kroon, and Z. I. P. Lobato. 2009. Bovine vaccinia outbreaks: Detection and isolation of *Vaccinia virus* in milk samples. *Foodborne Pathog. Dis.* 6:1141–1146.
- Castro, R. D., L. G. Oliveira, F. M. Sant'Anna, L. M. P. Luiz, S. H. C. Sandes, C. I. F. Silva, A. M. Silva, A. C. Nunes, C. F. A. M. Penna, and M. R. Souza. 2016. Lactic acid microbiota identification in water, raw milk, endogenous starter culture, and fresh Minas artisanal cheese from the Campo das Vertentes region of Brazil during the dry and rainy seasons. *J. Dairy Sci.* 99:6086–6096.
- Costa, G. B., L. Teodoro, S. Augusto, J. A. Leite, P. César, P. Ferreira, C. A. Bonjardim, J. S. Abrahão, E. G. Kroon, and E. C. Moreno. 2016. Seroprevalence of *Orthopoxvirus* in rural Brazil: Insights into anti-OPV immunity status and its implications for emergent zoonotic OPV. *Virol. J.* 13:121.
- de Oliveira, T. M. L., M. I. M. C. Guedes, I. S. Rehfeld, A. C. D. Matos, A. V. Rivetti, P. A. Alves, G. C. F. Galinari, M. M. O. P. Cerqueira, J. S. Abrahão, and Z. I. P. Lobato. 2015. Detection of *Vaccinia virus* in milk: Evidence of a systemic and persistent infection in experimentally infected cows. *Foodborne Pathog. Dis.* 12:898–903.
- de Oliveira, T. M. L., I. S. Rehfeld, J. M. F. Siqueira, J. S. Abrahão, R. K. Campos, A. K. R. dos Santos, M. M. O. P. Cerqueira, E. G. Kroon, and Z. I. P. Lobato. 2010. *Vaccinia virus* is not inactivated after thermal treatment and cheese production using experimentally contaminated milk. *Foodborne Pathog. Dis.* 7:1491–1496.
- Gurav, Y. K., C. G. Raut, P. D. Yadav, B. V. Tandale, A. Sivaram, M. D. Pore, A. Basu, D. T. Mourya, and A. C. Mishra. 2011. Buffalo-pox outbreak in humans and animals in Western Maharashtra, India. *Prev. Vet. Med.* 100:242–247.
- Lobato, Z., G. Trindade, M. Frois, E. Ribeiro, G. Dias, B. Teixeira, F. Lima, G. Almeida, and E. Kroon. 2005. Outbreak of exantemal disease caused by *Vaccinia virus* in human and cattle in Zona da Mata region, Minas Gerais. *Arq. Bras. Med. Vet. Zootec.* 57:423–429. (in Portuguese).
- Machado, E. C., C. L. L. F. Ferreira, L. M. Fonseca, F. M. Soares, and F. N. Pereira Junior. 2004. Physical-chemical and sensorial properties of artisanal Minas cheese produced in the region of Serrro, Minas Gerais [in Portuguese]. *Ciênc. Tecnol. Alim. Campinas.* 24:516–521.
- Moss, B. 2013. Poxvirus DNA replication. *Cold Spring Harb. Perspect. Biol.* 5:1–12.
- Rehfeld, I. S., M. I. M. C. Guedes, A. L. S. Frailha, A. G. Costa, A. C. D. Matos, A. T. L. Fiúza, and Z. I. P. Lobato. 2015. *Vaccinia virus* transmission through experimentally contaminated milk using a murine model. *PLoS One* 10:e0127350.