Short communication: Prevalence, antimicrobial resistance, and resistant traits of coagulase-negative staphylococci isolated from cheese samples in Turkey

Cemil Kürekci
Department of Food Hygiene and Technology, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Mustafa Kemal University, Hatay, Turkey

ABSTRACT
A total of 17 coagulase-negative staphylococci (CNS) isolates obtained from 72 cheese samples were included in this study. Coagulase-negative staphylococci isolates obtained in this study comprised 6 (35.3%) Staphylococcus saprophyticus, 3 (17.6%) Staphylococcus epidermidis, 2 (11.8%) Staphylococcus hominis, 2 (11.8%) Staphylococcus haemolyticus, 1 (5.9%) Staphylococcus xylosus, 1 (5.9%) Staphylococcus vitulinius, 1 (5.9%) Staphylococcus lentus, and 1 (5.9%) Staphylococcus warneri. The disc diffusion assay revealed that the highest occurrence of resistance was found for penicillin (76.5%), erythromycin (35.3%), tetracycline (29.4%), and trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole (17.6%) among CNS isolates. However, all CNS isolates were found to be susceptible to vancomycin, streptomycin, linezolid, and gentamycin. Of the isolates, 64.7% carried at least one of the following antimicrobial resistance genes: mecA, tet(M), erm(B), blaZ, ant(4′)-Ia, aphi(3′)-IIIa, and lon(A). The results suggest that improved hygienic conditions, such as safer handling of raw milk, proper cleaning, and sanitation during the manufacturing in the dairies, are urgently needed in Turkey.

Key words: coagulase-negative staphylococci, antimicrobial resistance, cheese

Short Communication
Staphylococcus spp. are gram-positive and nonmotile bacteria that have been divided into 2 groups: coagulase-positive and coagulase-negative staphylococci (Podkowik et al., 2013). Staphylococci are widely distributed in nature, and the primary habitat of staphylococci is the skin and mucous membranes of humans and warm-blooded animals. Staphylococci are highly tolerant to environmental extremes; for instance, they are able to grow well in a wide pH range (4.8–9.4) and have a high degree of tolerance to NaCl (7.5–10%; Schleifer and Kloos, 1975).

Although CNS have been considered as nonpathogenic normal commensal flora, recent studies have shown CNS to be one of the most common causes of nosocomial infections, particularly in immunocompromised and hospitalized patients (Koksal et al., 2009). In addition, CNS are often found in foods including meat, milk, and dairy products, and some strains are used in the preparation of fermented foods as a starter culture (Zell et al., 2008). Epidemiological studies showed that dairy products can be contaminated with CNS by using unpasteurized raw milk and also during manufacturing practices by workers. A case study of food poisoning outbreaks linked CNS strains with contaminated unpasteurized milk (Do Carmo et al., 2004). The safety of CNS strains in food has been questioned due to the fact that some CNS strains isolated from foods have the ability to produce several virulence factors, such as staphylococcal enterotoxins (Do Carmo et al., 2004; Bertelloni et al., 2015; Nunes et al. 2015). In addition, antimicrobial resistance and resistance determinants in CNS strains from foods have received attention because of the ability to transfer resistance genes to other bacterial species, including Staphylococcus aureus (Hiramatsu et al., 2001). The objective of the current study was to assess the distribution of CNS in different types of cheese samples in Turkey. Antimicrobial resistance profiles of isolated CNS together with antimicrobial resistance genes were also determined.

A total of 72 cheese samples consisting of 11 different types (6–7 samples each of White, Kaşar, Tulum, Ezine, Antep, Sürk, Lor, Van Otu, Civil, Örgü, and Diil) were analyzed in this study. These cheese samples were produced from raw or pasteurized cow, goat, and sheep milk. All cheese samples were collected from supermarkets, open-air markets, and retail shops between January and June 2014 in Hatay province, Turkey. All samples were transferred to the laboratory in an ice box and stored at 4°C before analysis.

Isolation of staphylococci was carried out by suspending 10 ± 1 g of each cheese sample in buffered peptone
water (90 mL). The suspension was then enriched at 37°C for 24 h. After an overnight incubation, mannitol salt agar plates were inoculated with 0.1 mL of the enriched suspension and incubated at 37°C for 24 h (Chajjeka-Wierzchowska et al., 2015). The selected staphylococci colonies (2–3 small pink or red colonies per plate for presumptive staphylococci) were streaked on blood agar plates and incubated at 37°C for 24 h.

The isolates were initially identified as *Staphylococcus* spp. by PCR amplification of the 16 ribosomal DNA gene using primers as described by Strommenger et al. (2003). All PCR-positive isolates were then examined for coagulase production using rabbit plasma with EDTA lyophilized according to the manufacturer’s instructions (Bactident Coagulase, Merck, Darmstadt, Germany). The identification of the coagulase negative isolates to the species level was further done by using VITEK2 automated system (bioMérieux, Marcy-l’Étoile, France).

The antimicrobial resistance profile of selected isolates was examined by using the disc diffusion method as described by the Clinical Laboratory Standards Institute (CLSI, 2015). Eleven antibiotics from different classes were included in the assay, including gentamicin (10 μg/disc), streptomycin (25 μg/disc), levofloxacin (5 μg/disc), vancomycin (30 μg/disc), linezolid (30 μg/disc), erythromycin (15 μg/disc), penicillin (10 μg/disc), tetracycline (30 μg/disc), chloramphenicol (30 μg/disc), clindamycin (10 μg/disc), and trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole (1.25/23.75 μg/disc). The bacterial inoculum was prepared from an overnight culture and standardized to 0.5 McFarland density of inoculum was standardized to 0.5 McFarland. Inoculum was prepared from an overnight culture and standardized to 0.5 McFarland. The bacterial inoculum was prepared from an overnight culture and standardized to 0.5 McFarland.

The results of the antimicrobial susceptibility tests revealed that 88.2% (n = 15/17) of CNS strains displayed antimicrobial resistance to at least one antibiotic (Table 1). In addition, 5 CNS isolates (29.4%) showed multidrug resistance (3 or more class of antimicrobials). As presented in Table 1, CNS isolates were 76.5% resistant to penicillin, 35.3% resistant to erythromycin, and 29.4% resistant to tetracycline.

In the current study, all CNS isolates were screened for selected resistance genes. As presented in Table 1, 3 isolates of *S. epidermidis* and 1 *S. haemolyticus* isolate were positive for the mecA gene. The 4 tetracycline-resistant isolates were found to carry the tet(M) gene, whereas only 2 erythromycin-resistant isolates contained erm(B) gene. Eight CNS isolates were confirmed to harbor the blaZ gene. Even though none of the CNS isolates were found to be resistant to gentamycin, vancomycin, streptomycin, and linezolid.

The isolates were screened for the presence of aminoglycosides resistance-associated genes [aac(6’)-Ie-aph(3’)-Ia, ant(4’)-Ia, and aph(3’)-IIIa] (Choi et al., 2003), and bluA genes (Lina et al., 1999), also determined by PCR.

A total of 17 staphylococci isolated from cheese samples were positive for 16S rDNA genes and were further identified to species level by using automated VITEK 2 system. These CNS isolates were belong to 8 species which were distributed as follows: *Staphylococcus saprophyticus* (n = 6/17; 35.3%), *Staphylococcus epidermidis* (n = 3/17; 17.6%), *Staphylococcus hominis* (n = 2/17; 11.8%), *Staphylococcus haemolyticus* (n = 2/17; 11.8%), *Staphylococcus xylosus* (n = 1/17; 5.9%), *Staphylococcus vitulinis* (n = 1/17; 5.9%), *Staphylococcus lentus* (n = 1/17; 5.9%), and *Staphylococcus warneri* (n = 1/17; 5.9%).
Recently, CNS gained great attention as being one of the leading bacterial groups associated with mastitis in cows and sheep (Pyörälä and Taponen, 2009) and nosocomial infections in humans (Koksal et al., 2009). Our study, therefore, was conducted to investigate the occurrence of CNS in Turkish cheese samples, which might have a significant role as a reservoir. Of 72 cheese samples examined in this study, 17 (23.6%) were found to be positive for CNS. In an earlier study in Turkey, CNS was recovered from 16.2% of dairy products, including Tulum cheese (Pamuk et al., 2010). In another study of bovine milk samples with mastitis, Kirkan et al., (2005) also found that CNS was present in 20% of milk samples examined. Among the isolated CNS strains, the following species were identified in the current study: S. saprophyticus, S. epidermidis, S. hominis, S. haemolyticus, S. xylosus, S. vitulinis, S. lentus, and S. warneri. In a study of staphylococcal isolates from raw milk and cheese in Italy, Ruoar et al., (2013) found that all raw milk and cheese samples had CNS at concentrations up to 10^3 and 10^5 cfu/mL, respectively. Their study on the raw milk and cheese revealed the following as the most common species: Staphylococcus equorum (12%), S. lentus (12%), Staphylococcus simulans (12%), Staphylococcus sciuri (10%), and S. xylosus (9%; Ruaro et al., 2013). In a study of French cow milk and cheeses, Coton et al., (2010) also recovered 15 different CNS species with S. equorum, S. xylosus, S. saprophyticus, and Staphylococcus succinus as the most dominant species. Among the isolated CNS species, S. xylosus is well established as the most commonly used starter culture, particularly in sausages (Zell et al., 2008); however, some studies have reported S. xylosus in animal infections (Taponen et al., 2006). Although the beneficial aspects of CNS to the development of characteristics of fermented dairy products are unquestioned, some of the species, particularly S. saprophyticus and S. epidermidis, have been associated with human illness (Otto, 2009).

Coagulase-negative staphylococci have been found to be resistant to multiple antimicrobial agents, including methicillin, which limits treatment options for staphylococcal infections. In these cases, other antimicrobials, including teicoplanin and vancomycin, are mostly considered as alternative drugs to treat severe infections. A previous report showed that methicillin resistance rates increased in a hospital environment (Koksal et al., 2009), suggesting that the presence of methicillin-resistant staphylococci in foods is troublesome. Of the various CNS isolates tested, 3 isolates of S. epidermidis and 1 of S. haemolyticus were positive for the mecA gene (n = 4; 23.5%) in the current study. Gurun and Kahya (2015) recently determined the presence of mecA gene in 12 of 118 CNS strains isolated from ground beef and lamb meat samples in Turkey. A much higher carriage rate (81.5%) of mecA-positive CNS from minas cheese was described in Brazil by Fontes et al. (2013). However, in another study, performed by Resch et al. (2008) in Germany, the mecA gene was not detected in food-associated CNS isolates, suggesting different prevalence rate in different geographical locations.

The current study confirmed previous findings that the prevalence of antimicrobial resistance of CNS isolates vary according to the species (Resch et al., 2008; Even et al., 2010). In the current study, CNS isolates were found to be phenotypically resistant to penicillin

### Table 1. Antimicrobial resistance identified in CNS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Phenotypic resistance</th>
<th>Antibiotic resistance genes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CNS-1</td>
<td>Tulum</td>
<td>Staphylococcus saprophyticus</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>ant(4’)-la, ermB, lnuA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-3</td>
<td>Tulum</td>
<td>S. saprophyticus</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>ant(4’)-la, ermB, lnuA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-5</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>S. saprophyticus</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-6</td>
<td>Tulum</td>
<td>S. saprophyticus</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>ant(4’)-la, ermB, lnuA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-21</td>
<td>Sirık</td>
<td>S. saprophyticus</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-25</td>
<td>Kasar</td>
<td>S. saprophyticus</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>ant(4’)-la, ermB, lnuA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-30</td>
<td>Örgü</td>
<td>Staphylococcus epidermidis</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-31</td>
<td>Kasar</td>
<td>S. epidermidis</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>ant(4’)-la, ermB, lnuA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-50</td>
<td>Tulum</td>
<td>S. epidermidis</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-9</td>
<td>Örgü</td>
<td>Staphylococcus hominis</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-12</td>
<td>Van Otlu</td>
<td>Staphylococcus haemolyticus</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-38</td>
<td>Sirık</td>
<td>S. haemolyticus</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-17</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Staphylococcus vitulinis</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-23</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Staphylococcus xylosus</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-26</td>
<td>Kasar</td>
<td>Staphylococcus warneri</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNS-29</td>
<td>Örgü</td>
<td>Staphylococcus lentus</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 TE = tetracycline; P = penicillin; E = erythromycin; C = chloramphenicol; CLI = clindamycin; LEV = levofloxacin; STX = trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole.

2 Not detected.
(76.5%). This is consistent with recent studies in which high rates of penicillin resistance were reported for CNS isolates of food, animal, or human clinical origin in Turkey (Turutoglu et al., 2006; Pamuk et al., 2010; Kenar et al., 2012). This result is not surprising given that penicillin is the most prescribed agent for the treatment of mastitis in cows in Turkey (Turutoglu et al., 2006), although the exact amount of antimicrobial agents and their classes used in animal husbandry is unknown. The results were, however, contradictory with another study, which reported no high resistance to penicillin (18%; Even et al., 2010). The resistance to erythromycin, tetracycline, levofloxacin, and chloramphenicol was similar to those obtained from foods in the European Union (Even et al., 2010) and from subclinical mastitis milks in Turkey (Aslantas et al. 2014; Bansal et al., 2015). This is inconsistent with the findings of Pamuk et al. (2010), who reported higher resistance rate to erythromycin, gentamicin, tetracycline, chloramphenicol, and vancomycin in CNS isolates from Tulum cheese and raw buffalo milk in Turkey. In the current study, 2 S. epidermidis (n = 2/3; 66.6%) and 1 S. haemolyticus isolate (n = 1/2; 50%) were found to be resistant to trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole, which was reported to be alternative to the penicillins for staphylococcal infections (Koksal et al., 2009). In addition, all the isolated strains were susceptible to vancomycin, streptomycin, linezolid, and gentamicin.

Several antimicrobial resistance genes were reported in CNS in different countries (Chajcka-Wierzchowska et al., 2015; Guran and Kahya, 2015; Recbechi et al., 2015). At least one of the tested genes was found in 64.7% of the CNS strains isolated in the current study, in accordance with recently published studies (Guran and Kahya, 2015; Recbechi et al., 2015). Approximately 47% of the CNS strains in our study harbored the structural gene blaZ that is the main mechanism of penicillin resistance in staphylococci. Guran and Kahya (2015) also reported a similar rate (46.2%) in CNS isolates from retail ground meats in Turkey. However, Resch et al. (2008) reported that only 10% of penicillin-resistant CNS isolates harbored the blaZ gene. In the current study, tet(M) was the only encountered gene in tetracycline-resistant CNS. Similarly, tet(M) has been reported from ready-to-eat food in Poland (Chajcka-Wierzchowska et al., 2015) and ground beef and lamb meat samples in Turkey (Guran and Kahya, 2015). Only 2 erythromycin-resistant CNS isolates carried the erm(B) gene, whereas in the remaining erythromycin-resistant strains the erm gene was not found, suggesting that other macrolide resistance genes such as msr(A/B) could be present (Chajcka-Wierzchowska et al., 2015). Of the 17 CNS isolates tested, 6 (35.2%) were positive for genes encoding aminoglycoside resistance; these included the ant(4’)-la (n = 4; 23.5%) and aph(3’)-IIIa genes (n = 2; 11.8%). But the presence of these genes determined by PCR did not associate with phenotypic gentamicin or streptomycin resistance. This discordance between gentamicin resistance and the presence of aac(6’)-Ile-aph(2’)-Ia, ant(4’)-Ia, and aph(3’)-IIIa has also been stated for clinical CNS isolates (Duran et al., 2012).

In conclusion, the results of this study revealed that the most isolated strains were S. saprophyticus, S. epidermidis, S. hominis, and S. haemolyticus. Coagulase-negative staphylococci strains have shown to have multidrug resistance to penicillin, tetracycline, and erythromycin, which are commonly used in veterinary practice, suggesting that particular attention should be paid to antimicrobial choice for treatment of diseases, particularly mastitis, in cows. In addition, the presence of antimicrobial resistance genes in CNS isolated from cheese samples is a major problem, as these strains can act as a reservoir for resistance genes to other bacterial species. Even though the number of samples examined in the current study is not high, it might be said that improved hygienic conditions such as safer handing of raw milk, proper cleaning, and sanitation during the manufacturing in the dairies are increasingly important to reduce the prevalence of multidrug resistance among CNS isolates in Turkey.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author thanks Özkan Aslantas (Mustafa Kemal University, Hatay, Turkey) for providing technical help.

REFERENCES


CLSI. 2015. Performance standards for antimicrobial susceptibility testing; twenty-fifth informational supplement. 35:M100–S25. CLSI, Wayne, PA.


